

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, JANUARY 26, 2012

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA VANOOTEGHEM, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

Nancy Cartmill, President, called the Board of Equalization and Review to order at 10:00 a.m.

APPEARING: **MARY WAYBRIGHT, CHIEF DEPUTY FOR THE**
ASSESSOR'S OFFICE

Mary Waybright, Chief Deputy stated the Assessor's Real, Personal, and Business Property Books were available for the Board to review, if needed.

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL, AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (A)**

10:00 A.M. **RICHARD GARDNER, APPEARING**
2094 MILLER ROAD, HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT – KYLE, MAP – 81, PARCEL – 0023

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$135,300 (Lowered to \$100,000-2/11)

2012 APPRAISED VALUE - \$122,000

VALUE IN MR. GARDNER'S OPINION - \$100,000

Mr. Richard Gardner appeared before the Board for the second year in a row, to contest the assessed value of his property. Mr. Gardner presented documentation to the Board regarding his property and surrounding properties on Miller Road. Mr. Gardner stated that he did not understand why his property was assessed at such a high value, when his home was one of the smallest with the least renovations in the area. Mr. Gardner went on to say that all the homes on Miller Road for sale had been sitting on the market for at least two years.

Jon Wheeler, Assessor's office, explained that the value of the home was determined by the selling price of homes in the area. Mr. Wheeler stated that due to comparable sales in the area the assessed value of Mr. Gardner's home was within reason. Mr. Wheeler also stated that Mr. Gardner's property was valued at \$146, 000.00 by Nationwide Insurance.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, JANUARY 26, 2012

PAGE TWO

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Gardner that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$122,000.00 to \$115,000.00 for the property of Richard Gardner, located at 2094 Miller Road, Huntington, Kyle District, Map 81 and Parcel 0023.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

10:30 A.M. JOHN MIDKIFF, APPEARING

5 BENTON COURT, HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT-BARBOURSVILLE, MAP-7H, PARCEL-

0045.0002.0000

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$81,500

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$90,300

VALUE IN MR. MIDKIFF'S OPINION- \$75,000

Mr. John Midkiff, appeared stating that he felt the appraised value of his home was too high for several reasons. Mr. Midkiff stated the home has only one bath with no tub and the home is only 1,300 sq ft in size. Mr. Midkiff went on to say that the road on which the home is located, is in shambles. Mr. Midkiff said that the homes on Benton Court were all built on a landfill, and due to that the foundations are slipping and the homes are falling apart. Mr. Midkiff also said that various people had applied for loans to purchase homes for sale on Benton Court and the bank refused to approve the loans.

John Perry, Assessor's office, stated that the appraised value of the home was determined by sales of comparable properties in the surrounding area. Mr. Perry provided the Commission with multiple sales of comparable homes in the area that were sold well above the amount for which Mr. Midkiff's home was appraised for.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Midkiff that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$90,300.00 to \$85,000.00 for the property of John Midkiff, located at 5 Benton Court, Huntington, Barboursville District, Map 7H, and Parcel 0045.0002.0000.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, JANUARY 26, 2012

PAGE THREE

11:00 A.M.

MARY CLIFF, APPEARING

701 WESTVIEW AVE., HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT-HTGN./GUYANDOTTE, MAP-68, PARCEL- 0156

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$54,200

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$64,900

Ms. Mary Cliff appeared, stating that she did not understand why the appraised value of her property had increased so greatly. Ms. Cliff said that she was a senior citizen on a fixed income and she could not afford to pay the extra amount in taxes.

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, stated that the value of property in the Guyandotte area had been increasing steadily over the past few years. Mr. Vineyard also said that Ms. Cliff's home is surrounded by very nice properties. Mr. Vineyard went on to say that Ms. Cliff's home was previously listed as fair condition, and he felt that the home's condition should be changed to average, which would play a part in the appraised value of the home.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Ms. Cliff that she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$64,900.00 to \$60,000.00, for the property of Mary Cliff, located at 701 Westview Ave, Huntington, Htgn/Guyandotte District, Map 68, and Parcel 0156.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

1:00 P.M. RALPH AND VERNA ELSWICK, APPEARING
4340 ALTIZER AVE., HUNTINGTON, WV
DISTRICT- HTGN./GUYANDOTTE, MAP-68, PARCEL-0156
2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$34,500
2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$57,700
VALUE IN MR. & MRS. ELSWICK'S OPINION- \$29,500

Ralph and Verna Elswick appeared, and stated that their home had not had any improvements within the past 15 years and they did not understand why the value of the home would increase. Mr. and Mrs. Elswick informed the Board that the property directly across the street from the Elswick's property houses a trailer court, which they feel has a negative effect on the property value.

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, stated that in the past few years, property values in the Altizer area had shown a significant increase. Mr. Vineyard also stated that the properties that Mr. & Mrs. Vineyard had listed as comparable, were appraised at a value higher than that of the Elswick's property.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, JANUARY 26, 2012

PAGE FOUR

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. & Mrs. Elswick that they would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$57,700.00 to \$53,000.00, for the property of Ralph and Verna Elswick, located at 4340 Altizer Ave, Huntington, Htgn./Guyandotte District, Map 37 and Parcel 0062.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 1:38 p.m., until Monday, January 6, 2012, at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, JANUARY 30, 2012

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA VANOOTEGHEM, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

ABSENT: **ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER**

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:00 a.m.

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL, AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve the correction of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

Exhibit (B)

10:00 A.M. **GLADYS CURRY- FAILED TO APPEAR**

10:15 A.M. **BETTY BOWEN, APPEARING**
3610 CRANE AVE., HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT- HTGN./GUYANDOTTE, MAP- 51, PARCEL- 0038

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$39,800

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$66,200

VALUE IN MS. BOWEN'S OPINION- \$62,000

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, JANUARY 30, 2012

PAGE FIVE

Betty Bowen appeared, stating that she had resided at this residence for the past 50 years and during that time no improvements had been done to the property. Ms. Bowen also stated that the home directly in front of hers was in the first stage of being condemned and she felt that this had a negative effect on the value of her own property.

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, stated that all property values in the Guyandotte area had been steadily on the rise for the past several years. Mr. Vineyard presented examples within a five block radius of Ms. Bowens home with sales upwards of \$85,000.00.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Ms. Bowen that she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Nancy Cartmill, President, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$66,200.00 to \$62,000.00 for the property of Betty Bowen located at 3610 Crane Ave, Huntington, Htgn./Guyandotte District, Map 51, and Parcel 0038.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

DISTRICT- HTGN.-GUYANDOTTE, MAP- 50, PARCEL- 0046

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$47,300

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$88,400

VALUE IN MS. BLACK'S OPINION- \$60,000

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY FEBRUARY 2, 2012

PAGE SIX

Tammy Black appeared, stated that she did not understand why the appraised value of her home had increased so substantially over the past year. Ms. Black stated the only improvements made to her home were the addition of a new roof and windows, and she cleaned up trash on the property. Ms. Black stated that she thought that the appraised amount was only for the front house, and she did not realize that the value of both homes were included in the appraisal. Ms. Black said that there were no improvements whatsoever on the back home.

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, stated that that the condition of the home had been changed from poor to average, which caused an increase in the appraised value. Mr. Vineyard also said that sales and property values in Guyandotte had been steadily rising. Mr. Vineyard informed the Commission that the appraised amount on the front home was actually lower than the amount Ms. Black felt it was worth. Mr. Vineyard stated that the front home was appraised at \$56,570.00, the back home was appraised at \$16,720.00 and the land was appraised at \$15,000.00.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, informed Ms. Black that she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Anne Yon, **moved to approve keeping the appraised value of the property at \$88,400.00.**
Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

2:00

MARK DAVIS, APPEARING

1099 LOCUST DRIVE HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT- GUYANDOTTE, MAP- 3Q, PARCEL- 0030

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$8,000

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$179,000

VALUE IN MR. DAVIS' OPINION- \$150,000

Mark Davis appeared, stating that he felt that appraised value of his property was far too high. Mr. Davis stated that the location of the apartments was in an undesirable area, which significantly lowered the value of the units. Mr. Davis said that comparable apartment buildings, in better neighborhoods, were only valued between \$30 and \$50 per square foot, whereas his units were appraised at approximately \$70 per square foot. Mr. Davis said that he felt his building should be lowered to \$60 per square foot.

Jon Wheeler, Assessor's office, stated that the other buildings that were appraised at lower amounts were significantly older units. Mr. Wheeler also stated that the bank appraisal that Mr. Davis submitted showed the value of the building itself at \$170,000.00, which did not include a land value in the total.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2012

PAGE SEVEN

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, informed Mr. Davis that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, **moved to lower the appraised value from \$179,000.00 to \$150,000.00, for the property of Mark Davis, located at 1099 Locust Drive, Huntington, Guyandotte District, Map 3Q and Parcel 0023.**

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, recessed the meeting at 2:02 p.m., until Monday, February 6, 2012, at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 6, 2012

PRESENT: ROBERT L. BAILEY, PRESIDENT PRO-TEM

ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER

RHONDA VANOOTEGHEM, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

ABSENT: NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, called the Board of Equalization and Review to order at 10:00 a.m.

10:00 A.M. DENVER ROLFE, APPEARING
1824 MIDLAND TRAIL, MILTON, WV
DISTRICT- CITY- MILTON, MAP- 11 PARCEL 0012
2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$78,000
2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$136,000
VALUE IN MR. ROLFE'S OPINION- \$80,000

Denver Rolfe appeared and stated that he had called into the Assessor's office and spoken with Jerry Vineyard about the amount of the appraisal prior to the Board of Equalization meeting. Mr. Rolfe said that Mr. Vineyard had stated during their conversation that the lot was an acre in size. Mr. Rolfe said that he measured the lot himself and that the lot was only .38 of an acre in size. Mr. Rolfe also stated that his land was slipping and there was no way anyone could build or modify the property from the way it currently sits. Mr. Rolfe also stated that two years ago a sewer line was installed that ran directly through his property which lowered the value as well.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 6, 2012

PAGE EIGHT

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, stated that Mr. Rolfe's property had been charged at an incorrect rate for several years. Mr. Vineyard informed the Board that prime property in the Milton area was supposed to be valued at \$80,000.00 per acre, whereas Mr. Rolfe's property was only being valued at \$20,000.00 per acre, due to an incorrect entry in the system. Mr. Vineyard also stated that he had not measured the property himself but the one acre measurement had been in the system for years. Mr. Vineyard stated that he would go and reevaluate the measurements for him, if Mr. Rolfe wished. Mr. Vineyard stated that only one acre of Mr. Rolfe's property was valued at \$80,000.00 per acre, and the remaining three acres was only valued at \$219 per acre, due to the fact that it was bottomland. Mr. Vineyard also pointed out that the two properties Mr. Rolfe listed as comparable were each valued at \$80,000 per square feet.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, informed Mr. Rolfe that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$136,000.00 to \$100,000.00 for the property of Denver Rolfe, located at 1824 Midland Trail, Milton, City Milton District, Map 11 and Parcel 0012.** Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, seconded the vote and the vote was unanimous.

10:30 A.M.

TROY ADKINS, APPEARING

218 1ST STREET, ALTIZER, HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT- HTGN.-GUYANDOTTE, MAP- 52, PARCEL- 0010

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$75,000

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$144,400

VALUE IN MR. ADKINS' OPINION- \$105,000

Troy Adkins appeared, stating that the appraised value of his home increased 91% over the past year, and he believed that was very unfair. Mr. Adkins stated that he had added a 900 square foot addition to his home, which cost approximately \$30,000.00. Mr. Adkins said he did not see how

that would cause an increase of \$69,400.00 in the value of the home. Mr. Adkins stated that he realized he had a nice home in an average neighborhood, but he still did not see how his property merited such a significantly higher appraised amount than the surrounding properties.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 6, 2012

PAGE NINE

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, said that most homes in the Altizer area were not much larger than the room addition that Mr. Adkins added. Mr. Vineyard said that the addition was basically like adding another home to the property. Mr. Vineyard also stated that he had two sales in the area of homes that were significantly smaller than that of Mr. Adkins and these homes sold for \$105,000.00 and \$98,000.00. Mr. Vineyard stated that most properties in the Altizer area saw an increase of approximately 30%, and when the room addition is taken into consideration, the increase in appraised value for Mr. Adkins' property was accurate.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, informed Mr. Rolfe that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$144,400.00 to \$115,00.00 for the property of Troy Adkins, located at 218 1st Street, Altizer, Htgn.-Guyandotte, Map 52 and Parcel 0010.** Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

11:00 A.M.

THOMAS & KIMBERLY NICHOLAS, APPEARING

2148 JOHNSTOWN ROAD, HUNTINGTON, WV

DISTRICT- HTGN./GUYANDOTTE, MAP- 68,

PARCEL- 0206-0002-0000

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$62,100

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$73,400

VALUE IN MR. & MRS. NICHOLAS' OPINION- \$68,500

Kimberly Nicholas appeared, stating that she felt that there was no reason that the value of her property should have undergone such a large increase. Mrs. Nicholas stated that she had lived at this address for 16 yrs, during which time the only renovations were vinyl siding, and windows. Mrs. Nicholas stated the renovations were done in 2006, so she did not understand why the increase would occur now. Mrs. Nicholas also wanted to know why the condition of her home was changed from fair to average.

Jerry Vineyard, Assessor's office, explained that average meant the home was in good condition for its age and not in need of immediate repair. Mr. Vineyard said that Mrs. Nicholas' home appeared to be in no need of repairs, which caused the condition of the home to be changed from fair to average. Mr. Vineyard also stated that the assessed value of the home had to be plus or minus 10% of market value, and he was fine with lowering the appraised value of the home to \$68,500.00, if the Commission was in agreement.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2012

PAGE TEN

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$73,400.00 to \$68,500.00 for the property of Thomas & Kimberly Nicholas, located at 2148 Johnstown Road, Huntington, Gideon District, Map 68 and Parcel 0206-0002-0000.** Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, recessed the meeting at 11:20 a.m., until Friday, February 10, 2012, at 10:00 a.m.

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA VANOOTEGHEM, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal, and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (D)**

10:00 A.M. **JOYCE MCKINNEY, APPEARING**

3238-A HOWELLS MILL ROAD, ONA, WV

DISTRICT- 03 MAP- 12 PARCEL- 0003

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$20,300

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$30,500

VALUE IN MS. MCKINNEY'S OPINION- \$10,780

Joyce McKinney appeared, stating that the building on the property was simply for storage and was not able to serve as a residence. Ms. McKinney explained that there were no utilities, no plumbing, and no insulation in the building, and the only improvements have been the addition of windows, a door, and vinyl siding. Ms. McKinney stated that she wanted to know how the Assessor's office arrived upon the new amount.

Brent Williams, Assessor's office, stated that there were two methods used to arrive at the assessed amount, the first method being computerized, which takes into consideration what it would cost to rebuild the building minus the cost of depreciation. Mr. Williams explained this method returned an amount of \$33,100. Mr. Williams also explained that the next method was to use comparable sales in the area to arrive upon a value. Mr. Williams found comparable sales in the area, one for \$34,000 and a second for \$40,000. Mr. Williams said both of these methods returned similar amounts.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 16, 2012

PAGE ELEVEN

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Ms. McKinney that she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$30,500.00 to \$22,000.00, for the property of Joyce McKinney, located at 3238-A Howells Mill Road, Ona, 03 District, Map 12 and Parcel 0003. Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 10:20 a.m., until Thursday, February 16, 2012 at 1:00 p.m.

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**

 ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER

 ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER

 RHONDA VANOOTEGHEM, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

APPROVE: **CORRECTION OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON REAL,**

 PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Anne Yon, Commissioner, moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor. Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (D)**

1:00 P.M. **CHRISTINA SYPCH, APPEARING**

 DECHARME, MCMILLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

 APPEARING FOR:

 BPS PRINTING SYSTEMS, LLC/FLINT GROUP

2400 5TH AVENUE HUNTINGTON, WV

**NOTE: THE STATE TAX DEPARTMENT WILL BE PRESENT FOR THIS HEARING
TO DEFEND THEIR VALUE**

DISTRICT- GIDEON, MAP- 20, PARCEL- 98.1

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$3,457,800

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$3,441,500

VALUE IN THEIR OPINION-NO OPINION PROVIDED

FEB.17, 2011 BOE LOWERED APPRAISED VALUE TO

\$3,000,000

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 16, 2012

PAGE TWELVE

DISTRICT- GIDEON, MAP- 20, PARCEL- 43

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$780,000

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$779,900

VALUE IN THEIR OPINION-NO OPINION PROVIDED

FEB. 17, 2011 BOE LOWERED APPRAISED VALUE TO

\$600,000

DISTRICT- GIDEON, MAP 20, PARCEL-45

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$651,900

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$651,900

VALUE IN THEIR OPINION- NO OPINION PROVIDED

FEB. 17, 2011 BOE LOWERED APPRAISED VALUE TO

\$525,000

DISTRICT- GIDEON, MAP-20, PARCEL- 91

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$126,300

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$126,300

VALUE IN THEIR OPINION- NO OPINION PROVIDED

FEB. 17, 2011 BOE LOWERED APPRAISED VALUE TO

\$115,000

DISTRICT- GIDEON, MAP- 20, PARCEL- 210

2011 APPRAISED VALUE- \$2,400

2012 APPRAISED VALUE- \$2,400

VALUE IN THEIR OPINION- NO OPINION PROVIDED

FEB. 17, 2011 BOE- RAMAINED AS ASSESSOR HAD IT

Christina Spych, DeCharme, McMillen & Associates, appeared providing documentation for the Board to review. Ms. Spych stated that the land should be considered as one economic unit, because she did not believe they could be sold separately. Ms. Spych explained that the land and buildings were all old industrial properties and the buildings themselves were at least one hundred years old. Ms. Spych went on to say the last improvements done to the property were in 1998, and major improvements would need to be done if sold. Ms. Spych also stated that there was not much of a market for this type of industrial property, and finding a buyer would be extremely difficult. Ms. Spych also stated that the most likely situation would be that the buildings would be torn down if the property was sold.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 16, 2012

PAGE THIRTEEN

Ms. Spych informed the Board, that her calculations showed the property to be assessed at \$15.99 per square foot, which she believed to be extremely high. Ms. Spych presented comparable properties within West Virginia, which showed that the average square foot value was just over \$5.00. Ms. Spych also showed the Board comparable properties throughout the country including superior markets, for which the average price still averaged out to only \$10 per square foot. Ms. Spych stated that she believed the property should be valued at the most, at 2.5 million.

Timothy Wagoner, State Tax Attorney, appeared before the Board with Clinton Pauley, Senior Appraiser from the State Tax Department. Mr. Wagoner asked Mr. Pauley how long he had been with the State Tax Department, to which Mr. Pauley replied that he had been with the State Tax Department for over 30 years. Mr. Wagoner asked Mr. Pauley if he agreed with the amounts that Ms. Spych listed per square footage. Mr. Pauley stated that his calculations showed the property valued at \$12.01 per square foot, before he backed out the yard items.

Mr. Wagoner, asked Mr. Pauley if he used any comparable properties to arrive upon the appraised amount. Mr. Pauley said that he used the sale of the Dolan Building, which sold at \$11.79 per square foot and he used property located at 2300 3rd Avenue in Huntington, which sold at \$16.41 per square foot. Ms. Spych stated that the dates these buildings were sold was at the peak of the market, and also that these buildings were much newer than the property in question.

Mr. Wagoner asked Mr. Pauley if he felt that the value applied to the property was accurate. Mr. Pauley said he felt that the value was properly assigned, and the fact that the building was still actively in use, added to its value.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Ms. Spych that she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2012 appraised value from \$3,441,500.00 to \$2,800,000.00 for Parcel 98.1.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2012 appraised value from \$779,900.00 to \$500,000.00 for Parcel 43.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2012 appraised value from \$651,900.00 to \$450,000.00 for Parcel 45.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 16, 2012

PAGE FOURTEEN

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2012 appraised value from \$126,300.00 to \$115,000.00 for Parcel 91.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve keeping the appraised value of \$2,400.00 in effect for Parcel 210.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

1:30 P.M. DEANNA ALLEN- CANCELLED, CHARLESTON

LOWERED COAL VALUE ON BOTH PARCELS

2:00 P.M. RICHARD BOYLE- CANCELLED, RESCHEDULED

HEARING TO BE SET BEFORE THE BOARD OF

ASSESSMENT APPEALS IN OCTOBER, 2012

3:00 P.M. TIM & KIMBERLY KOLETKA- CANCELLED, MR.

KOLETKA STATED THAT AFTER HE COMPLETED

**HIS RESEARCH, THE ASSESSED VALUE APPEARED
TO BE FAIR**

There being no further business before the Board of Equalization and Review, the meeting was adjourned Sine Die, at 1:45 p.m.

PRESIDENT, COUNTY COMMISSION

KSC:ar

